Pedagogy of the Unknown:
Preparing in a State of Uncertainty

Mara Benadusi
Department of Political and Social Sciences
University of Catania, Italy
mara.benadusi@unict.it
A Sri Lankan story from Theravada Buddhism
A series of tidal waves striking down a beautiful island

A first tsunami hits the island and half of the population dies

New people arrives and starts to live in the island with the other half of the residents that had survived

They do not listen the warnings issued by the former residents and begin to drink alcohol, fill the land with refuse and defecate all over without cleaning up

The Gods are offended and conspire to have the ocean wash everything away

A compassionate God warms the residents while a rival deity tells them to ignore the warning

The inhabitants divide into two groups:
- the first group follows an improvident leader who ignores the God’s advice
- The second group follows a more judicious leader who builds a boat and equips it

A second tsunami strikes the island

Little by little every person who did not seek refuge on the boat is entirely submerged
The educational aspects of the story

✔ The importance of prevention and effective response
   Knowing ahead of time the probability that something will occur, predicting its effects and circulating this information through alarm systems are vital factors

✔ Preparation also play a fundamental role
   The last hope of salvation from a threat that can only be mitigated through proactive measures

✔ Disasters are selective
   From the Latin world “dis-astrum” = taking the protection of the stars away from insensitive humans
The educative value of the story allows me to introduce the topic of my presentation

**DISASTER EDUCATION**

Experiences of teaching/learning aimed at promoting skills that help people to survive in cases of catastrophe

Disaster education includes not only school-based initiatives, but also public information campaigns, family and community learning, adult education and popular culture (J. Preston 2012)

And it makes use of a wide range of pedagogical tools in preparing for disasters
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Educational systems</th>
<th>Learning contexts</th>
<th>Data Sources</th>
<th>Data collection techniques</th>
<th>Types of data</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>FORMAL</td>
<td>DE at the institutional level (DE initiatives targeting schools in the form of teaching units and/or training laboratories)</td>
<td>Policy statements, educational guidelines and technical reports as well as didactic materials related to teaching/learning activities (training exercises, illustrated manuals, educational videos, interactive games, etc.)</td>
<td>Documentary research methods (relevant documents are obtained and analyzed)</td>
<td>Documentary data collected from the internet: web pages, online library resources (from the websites of both governmental and non-governmental organizations: USAID, Red Cross, Care, Save the Children, etc.)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NON-FORMAL</td>
<td>Community-based education (Training courses, workshops and participatory learning exercises at national and community levels)</td>
<td>Policy statements, educational guidelines and technical reports as well as didactic materials related to teaching/learning activities (training exercises, illustrated manuals, educational videos, interactive games, etc.)</td>
<td>Documentary research methods (relevant documents are obtained and analyzed)</td>
<td>Documentary data collected from the internet: web pages, online library resources (from the websites of both governmental and non-governmental organizations: USAID, Red Cross, Care, Save the Children, etc.)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INFORMAL</td>
<td>Accidental learning in everyday life: daily-practice based (Conversation and informal communication in family, temple, work and social life spheres)</td>
<td>In-depth/unstructured interviews, informal colloquia, group discussions, observational and reflective field notes, photographs</td>
<td>Overt participant observation</td>
<td>Dialogical data collected in the course of on-site ethnographic encounters</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Some examples
Disaster education materials
ABOUT ANDROID
The ANDROID disaster resilience network was established in 2011 (Academic Network for Disaster Resilience to Optimise Educational Development). The network was set up to promote co-operation and innovation among European Higher Education and in doing so, to increase society’s resilience to disasters of human and natural origin. An underlying tenet of ANDROID is that higher education should be more innovative, providing opportunities to work in close collaboration with industry, communities, humanitarian agencies, private sectors and other higher education institutions.

The ANDROID Network is funded under the EU Lifelong Learning Programme. With a budget of nearly €7 billion for 2007 to 2013, the programme funded a range of actions including exchanges, study visits and networking activities. Projects are intended not only for individual students and learners, but also for teachers, trainers and all others involved in education and training.
A new phenomenon?

The strategic use of education in DRR is not a recent phenomenon. However...

in the past, training activities were almost exclusively aimed at specialized personnel:

fire fighters, police forces, civil defence volunteers, Red Cross, relief workers, government officials, hazard managers and technicians.

Training was characterized by a technical orientation and was provided by experts in a top-down manner.
Families and communities were targeted for the most part with informational campaigns, delivered through print and traditional media that focused on promoting national security and civil defence/protection.

(Preston, 2012)
The Educational shift

Topics such as capacity building and teaching resilience and disaster preparedness at the grassroots level only recently have attracted a widespread political attention.

When did this process start?

The International Decade for Natural Disaster Reduction launched by the United Nations (UN) in the 1990s.
Priority 3

‘disasters can be substantially reduced if people are well informed and motivated to adopt a culture of disaster prevention and resilience, which in turn requires the collection, compilation and dissemination of relevant knowledge and information on hazards, vulnerabilities and capacities’

Community Learning from the bottom-up

The International Decade of Education for Sustainable Development (2005–2014), led by UNESCO, has provided a long-term focus for moving this agenda forward.
These budget allocations have been presented as decisive measures that will make local populations more aware of the threat of natural hazards and better prepared before disasters strike.
A universal passkey

The conviction that a permanent state of uncertainty requires an attitude of constant readiness which must be continuously reinforced through appropriate learning activities.

From formal to non-formal learning settings
From local contexts to national and international arenas
At both the grassroots and policy level

In community-based projects as well as capacity building for non-governmental organizations, practitioners, school teachers and government officials.
Disaster Education incorporated in schools
Emergency drills in school in Aceh Province

We might note the extensive use of drills
Summer camp, schools teach Tajikistan children to survive and save others in disaster situations.

Simulations and so-called scenario exercises as a form of practical training for preparedness.
Numerous initiatives of DE are carried out in schools in the form of internet programs, teaching/learning units, fun initiatives (cartoons books, puzzles, games, etc.), simulations, and much more

This collection of tools is presented as collaboratively constructed and directed at the community
PART B

Here is a fuller list of some of the first things that organisations around the world will send to help victims of the tsunami. Give each one a rating (1 for highest priority, 4 for lowest) and be prepared to explain your choices in a class discussion.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Water</th>
<th>Teachers</th>
<th>Clothing</th>
<th>Batteries</th>
<th>Tents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Assessment teams</td>
<td>Medical supplies</td>
<td>Bulldozers and trucks</td>
<td>Plastic sheeting</td>
<td>Soap and towels</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Doctors</td>
<td>Planes</td>
<td>Radios</td>
<td>Toys</td>
<td>Blankets</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Money</td>
<td>Books</td>
<td>Food</td>
<td>Thongs</td>
<td>Ships</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The pictures below all show areas of Aceh in Indonesia after the tsunami. Label each one with the following information.

1. What type of photo is it – aerial, ground – level or satellite imagery?
2. What kind of information does it contain?
3. Which groups might use this photo to help them in planning relief efforts?
Argument

This educational agenda is characterized by a high degree of standardization at both the linguistic level and that of mechanisms of action.

Terms such as “preparedness” and “resilience” are becoming buzzwords and their use is progressively naturalized.

Far from being a neutral technology of learning, DE represents a way in which identities and subjectivities are reinforced and formed.
Constructing a universe of meanings around disasters

The use of specific discourses and imagines contribute to shaping how people think about and face disasters.

Discourses and Images conveyed through disaster education activities and reports particularly impact the representation of individuals involved: victims, heroes, active survivors...
What kinds of individuals or populations best embody a culture useful to communicate messages concerning Disaster Risk Reduction Education?
The shift in emphasis from the state to civil society, from technocrats to citizens in DRR policies and practices (Rose, 1999)

Citizens as pure victims to be saved by the State
Citizens as active survivors

Beichuan Earthquake museum, China
The recent paidocentric turn in DE

Paidocentric = centred on children (from the Greek language: “paidos” = children)

The International Strategy for Disaster Reduction (ISDR) volume Let Our Children Teach Us! (Wisner 2006) effectively illustrates the recent paidocentric turn in DE, depicting youth as a motor of change for society as a whole.
Children’s images are used in DE campaigns as a kind of ‘mediatic megaphone’ to convey the urgent need to spread this culture of preparedness in the society at large.

Beyond simply learning to better protect themselves, they are given the pivotal role of teaching and warning adults.

The stance we call ‘governance through public responsibility’ is here reformulated into what we might describe as ‘governance through the responsibilization of children’.
The 11-year-old school girl who saved many tourists on Phuket, Thailand, thanks to a geography lesson that allowed her to recognize the warning signs of the tsunami a few minutes before it crashed down on the island’s coasts in December of 2004.

Her bright face and the uniform she wears have been featured in the campaign to spread a culture of preparedness in the face of natural disasters.

The Tilly Smith case served as a motivating factor to launch the 2006–2007 campaign “Disaster Risk Reduction Begins at School”, which was co-sponsored by the UNISDR.
These images contribute in shaping public and professional representations of the victims of disasters as people that suffer and are incapable of recovering from disaster without external assistance.
The shift from vulnerability to resilience

WHY?
Images of resilience

Survivors are usually represented as active individuals. They are portrayed in groups: while they are reconstructing their houses, seating together to produce an evacuation map, participating in a training workshop... They are “doing” something: working, learning...
### Questions

1. Is resilience the opposite of vulnerability?
2. Does a status of vulnerability imply a lack or low level of resilience?
3. Can we consider vulnerability and resilience instead as two interdependent factors?

### Critics

2. Walker and Cooper warn that resilience is becoming a new ‘methodology of power’.

   Indeed, resilience as a DRR educational strategy could be used to compensate for shortfalls in institutional response, thus forcing individuals and families to bounce back after a disaster with little or no external assistance.
The resilience paradigm

The absence of clarity in its definition

The resilience paradigm seems to be based on an intangible and difficult to define cultural capacity.

The frequent use of terms such as readiness, resourcefulness, and watchfulness gives a clear idea of this open-endedness.

Is resilience an intrinsic (internal, endogenous, naturally emergent and context oriented) capacity of a system or a community impacted by disaster?

Or is resilience a potential ability that requires refinement? Something to be built and cultivated through education (“learn to bounce back” in case of disaster)? But through what methods?
Conservative vs Transformative

Building a culture of resilience through learning might produce dubious results: What could happen if forms of political and economic exploitation at the expense of subaltern classes prove to be equally resilient to trauma?

Which is the resilience-to-be-supported and which is the resilience-to-be-fought?

The character and direction of change

The risk of giving rise to neoliberal trends capable of dismantling public educational systems, as occurred in post-Katrina New Orleans, where privatization moves led to the rise of charter schools (Saltman, 2007)
Conclusion

DE could absolve public institutions of their responsibilities in a period of rising disaster capitalism, shifting those responsibilities to local population: **Protect yourself from hazards**

It’s important to develop an alternative discourse and alternative practices of DRR Education
Thank you

Mara Benadusi
Department of Political and Social Sciences
University of Catania, Italy
mara.benadusi@unict.it
Personal references

